DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 298 066 SO 019 460

AUTHOR Morgan, Jack C.; Banaszak, Ronald A.
TITLE The Relationship between Economics and Civics in Economic Textbooks and Civics Curriculum Guides.
SPONS AGENCY Foundation for Teaching Economics, San Francisco, Calif.
PUB DATE Apr 88
NOTE 31p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (New Orleans, LA, April 5-9, 1988).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Civics; *Content Analysis; *Curriculum Guides; *Economics; Economics Education; Educational Research; Instruction; *Integrated Activities; Material Development; Research Projects; Secondary Education; Social Studies; State Curriculum Guides; Teaching Methods; *Textbook Content; Textbooks

ABSTRACT

This research project analyzes the civics content in six secondary economics textbooks and the economics content in 25 state and local civics curriculum guides in order to determine integration patterns. The report also contains information about potential content integration topics, appropriate teaching strategies, and implications for materials development. Integrated economics and civics curriculum suggestions include: (1) tracing economic, political, and social roles of young adults; (2) using decision-making models; (3) adapting a chronological or topical teaching approach within the context of U.S. economic and political history; (4) using case studies that relate economics to civics; (5) actively involving students in a study of their community, state, or the United States; and (6) developing the curriculum around a few specific themes. Appendices include: (1) a bibliography of the analyzed economics textbooks; (2) the economics textbook and the civics curriculum guide evaluation forms; and (3) a list of the states and local school districts whose curriculum guides were analyzed. Nine tables are included. (JHP)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

8-4-88

ED298066

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ECONOMICS AND CIVICS IN ECONOMIC TEXTBOOKS AND CIVICS CURRICULUM GUIDES

Foundation for Teaching Economics

SO 019 460

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Ronald Banaszak
Jack C. Morgan

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ECONOMICS AND CIVICS IN ECONOMIC TEXTBOOKS AND CIVICS CURRICULUM GUIDES

Jack C. Morgan
University of Louisville and
Kentucky Council on Economic Education

Ronald A. Banaszak
Foundation for Teaching Economics

Paper Presented at

American Educational Research Association
Annual Meeting
New Orleans
1988

Research conducted under a grant from the

FOUNDATION FOR TEACHING ECONOMICS
550 Kearny Street - Suite 1000
San Francisco, CA 94108

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ECONOMICS AND CIVICS
IN ECONOMIC TEXTBOOKS AND CIVICS CURRICULUM GUIDES

The Foundation for Teaching Economics is the nation's leading proponent of economic education in grades 7-10. Established in 1975, the FTE has pioneered innovative approaches to teaching young adolescents how America's economic system works. As part of this effort the FTE has participated in the development of a variety of student instructional materials, outreach projects to school districts and research.

As FTE began its second decade in 1986, its Trustees and staff conducted a thorough evaluation of its objectives and past programs in order to establish a strategic plan to guide its future activities. As a result of that planning process, the FTE reaffirmed its commitment to develop innovative instructional materials especially appropriate for young adolescents. In addition to creating materials for a one semester economic course and for a substantial economics unit in another social studies course, the FTE will create both basal and supplementary materials for other commonly taught social studies courses.

Civics is the first traditional social studies course to be targeted for a major FTE materials development effort. The FTE proposes to develop a variety of materials, including a civics textbook, that will provide a means to integrate the study of economics into the civics course. The Constitutional Rights Foundation, a 25-year old law-related education organization, has joined with the FTE in this effort. Several factors contributed to focusing on the civics course. Civics is commonly viewed as a government course, yet it is difficult to study the government without some study of the economy. In addition, some states, most notably North Carolina, have begun to require economics instruction in the civics course and publishers of civics textbooks are including economic units in their books.

Before committing itself to this major new effort, the FTE commissioned several studies relating to civics and economics instruction. Since textbooks are so important in shaping classroom instruction, Dr. Jack Morgan, Executive Director of the Kentucky Council on Economic Education, was given two research grants by the FTE to analyze the civics content of economics textbooks and to analyze civics curriculum guides to determine what economic content, if any, is being recommended to school districts. These studies were designed to provide more precise information to guide the FTE's materials development effort. The rest of this paper reports on these two studies.

CIVICS CONTENT IN SELECTED ECONOMICS TEXTBOOKS

Procedures

This study analyzed the civics content in six well-known secondary economics textbooks. Each textbook was independently analyzed by Dr. Morgan and three high school economics and civics teachers, one in Kentucky and two in California. Analysis was conducted using the Economics Textbook Analysis Form, a modification of the Civics Textbook Analysis Form developed by Davis.[1] The topics of analysis listed on the form were created by a team of social studies educators including Dr. Morgan, Dr. Ronald A. Banaszak, Vice President of Educational Programs at the FTE and Dr. James E. Davis, then Vice President for Program Development at the FTE. Dr. Morgan met with each of the teachers to discuss their ratings of each text. Variations in ratings were handled in ways described in each of the following sections. Appendix A lists the six textbooks used in this study and Appendix B contains a copy of the Economics Textbook Analysis Form. Unfortunately reviewers inadvertently analyzed two editions of The American Economic System--Free Enterprise (1981, 1987). After comparison of the two editions by Dr. Morgan and the teacher reviewers, it was agreed that these editions were not sufficiently different to change the results.

Results of Analysis

Physical Characteristics of Textbooks

Each of the textbooks was published in hardcover. Table 1 summarizes the physical characteristics of the books. The estimated average number of pages dealing with civics/legal content was 47.3 pages or 11 percent of the average textbook of 419 pages. The median number of units for the books was six. One textbook, however, Our Economy: How It Works was not divided into units. The median number of chapters was 19.5. Publication information for all the texts can be found in Appendix A.

Table 1

PAGES, CHAPTERS AND UNITS FOR ECONOMICS TEXTS

	No. of Total Pages	Number of Pages of Civics/Legal Content	Number of Chapters	Number of Units
Range	320-580	22-62	8-46	0-8
Mean	419	47.3	23.5	5.2

Analysis of Content

Most of the textbook analysis was directed at discovering the nature and extent of civics content in the textbooks and the appropriateness of teaching strategies for young adolescents.

When considering what civics content to include in a textbook that integrates civics and economics, special consideration must be given to the most frequently occurring content in current economics textbooks. This content represents what is most successful at the present time. To be a part of this market, a future textbook cannot depart far from the mainstream.

The frequency of occurrence of Civics/Legal content in the textbooks is summarized in Table 2. (See Economics Textbook Analysis Form in Appendix B for a list of content categories.) All six books included some information falling under the categories of "Why Government," "Executive Agencies," "Paying for National Government" and "Government and the Economy." The categories "Why Government" and "Paying for National Government" were covered in depth in five books while "Government and the Economy" was covered in all six books. None of the books treated "Executive Agencies" in depth. Information about "Why Government" usually included a positive, economic justification for the existence of the government. The textbooks considered "Executive Agencies" at different places throughout the book when describing economic intervention by the agencies. The categories "Paying for National Government" and "Government and the Economy" are both obvious topics for in-depth coverage in economics textbooks. Frequently, these are treated in separate chapters. The roles of government, such as producer, consumer and monitor of the health of the economy, are found in these chapters.

Table 2 shows that five of the six economics textbooks also deal with the categories "Public Policy Decision Making," "State Government" and "Local Government." Generally, these topics are not covered in depth. Other topics reported in Table 2 are found less frequently in the textbooks and are seldom covered in depth.

Table 2

CIVICS/LEGAL CONTENT

Content Categories	Frequency of Occurrence	Frequency of Occurrence in Depth
Why Government	6	5
Executive Agencies	6	0
Paying for National Government	6	5
Government and the Economy	6	6
Public Policy Decision Making	5	2
State Government	5	0
Local Government	5	0
What Is Government	4	0
Citizens Rights and Responsibilities	3	1
The Congress	3	0
The Presidency	2	0
Lobbying and Interest Groups	2	1
The Role and Workings of the Courts	2	0
U.S. Constitutional Convention	1	0
Three Branches of Government	1	0
Federal Court System	1	0
Foreign Policy	1	0

Seventy percent of the time, all four analysts agreed about whether the civics/legal content was included in the books. In 24% of the cases there were three/one splits, and in six percent of the cases there were 2/2 splits. Three/one splits were resolved by choosing the category the three

had selected. Two/two splits were resolved by indicating the topic was included. This was done because it is likely that two analysts simply overlooked the topic.

Regarding agreement about whether the topics were covered in depth, 2/2 splits occurred 10% of the time. These were resolved arbitrarily by indicating that the topic was covered in depth. Analysts had more trouble agreeing about some topics, such as "Executive Agencies" and "Why Government." Disagreement about the presence of information about "Executive Agencies" probably occurred because of uncertainty about which agencies are included. Content pertaining to the category "Why Government" was more difficult to determine because the materials were not explicitly responding to the question implicit in the category heading. Some other topics, such as "Paying for Government" and "Government and the Economy" were analyzed with almost total consensus--probably because they were often covered in separate chapters.

Content Integration Pattern

Civics content forms a part of the economic textbooks in three different ways. First, most of the books had a separate chapter dealing with government in the economy. Second, the books integrate government in the study of economics when it appears necessary to understand the economics or to understand our economic system. Third, the discussion of government may be in separate sections or subsections of the economics chapters. One book, by Brown and Warner, has a separate chapter that treats citizenship itself. In discussions of citizenship, emphasis is on the citizen role, economic rights, consumer rights, and individual responsibilities in the economy. Regulation in the economy is a frequent topic that is integrated with economics. The books also describe the functions of regulatory agencies, such as the Federal Trade Commission and the Securities and Exchange Commission. Of course, government and economics are integrated in discussions of monetary policy and the Federal Reserve System, fiscal policy and economic policy. Economic policy examines alternative ways for government to address problems such as pollution, poverty, energy conservation, resource use and population.

Potential Content Integration Topics

Some topics which occur less frequently in economics texts could also be used when integrating civics and economics. This author recommends the inclusion of "Citizens Rights and Responsibilities," "Lobbying and Interest Groups," "Foreign Policy" and the "Federal Court System." "Citizens Rights and Responsibilities" is recommended because of citizen's economic rights and responsibilities as illustrated by President Kennedy's Consumer Bill of Rights. "Lobbying and Interest Groups" is recommended because of the strong economic interests which are so often behind the efforts of lobbyists. In today's democracy, many decisions are made because of well-organized political action groups. "Foreign Policy" is recommended because of young peoples' need to understand the legal process and because so much law involves economic issues.

Content areas which are missing or receiving little emphasis, but should be considered for integration in an economics/civics textbook include the relationships among personal economic decision making, democratic decision making and group decisions, foreign policy and international trade, comparative economic and comparative political systems, state and local government, world economic development, law, budgets and the three branches of government.

In addition, textbook authors need to consider using a historical context for integrating economics and civics. History can provide the basis for a descriptive narrative to present information about both subjects. Many junior high school and middle school teachers have more social science credit hours in history than in any other subject; therefore, they should be comfortable with presenting civics and economics in a historical context.

Analysis of Pedagogy

Table 3 summarizes findings regarding appropriateness of teaching strategies for young adults. The books are excellent to good in using "Concrete Learning Tasks" and "Data About Society." The books are weakest in use of "Simulations" and "Cartoons;" however, these conclusions are limited because the analysts did not have teacher's guides or student activity books for four books.

Table 3

APPROPRIATENESS OF TEACHING STRATEGIES FOR YOUNG ADULTS

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor
Real World Examples	2	2	2	0
Concrete Learning Tasks	1	5	0	0
Case Studies	1	2	2	1
Simulations	0	1	3	2
Cartoons	0	1	3	2
General Information of Interest to Age Group	0	4	2	0
Data about Society (civic/legal/economic)	1	4	1	0

Based on this analysis, a book integrating civics and economics should include more simulations, case studies and cartoons. Although "Real World Examples" and "Concrete Learning Tasks" seem to be well represented in the six books analyzed, they deserve thoughtful attention in the integration of civics content with economics, where their inclusion may become more difficult.

There were few disagreements among analysts when rating the books on appropriateness of teaching strategies. When disagreements occurred, the same rules for resolving differences in Table 2 were used in resolving differences in Table 3. Regarding individual books, Free Enterprise--the American Economic System had the lowest ratings and Our Economy: How It Works had the highest ratings.

When asked to comment about teaching strategies in general, at least one of the four analysts mentioned they liked the case study approach, familiar content, information about careers, consumer economics content, graphs, news stories, issues or "viewpoints" pages and community activities, such as interviews. Opportunities to study relationships in the local economy and local government will help make the study of economics and civics practical, concrete and personally meaningful. Teaching strategies such as role playing, case studies, and simulations provide opportunities for students to learn actively while studying the political and economic systems in which they are participating. Other comments from this portion of the Economics Textbook Analysis Form are summarized in other parts of this report.

Limitations

This research would be more conclusive if more than four teachers had been able to participate in the analysis. Similarly, the analysis of more textbooks would also strengthen the conclusions reached. The reliability among analysts, although respectfully high, would have been higher if they had met before analyzing the books and arrived at clear, common meanings of the civics content categories. Analysts soon identified books which they liked, did not like or were familiar with. This could prejudice the analyses, especially when rating the appropriateness of teaching strategies. Finally, the author, who was also one of the analysts, although aware of the potential problems, could unknowingly let his own views become too dominant in preparing the research report.

Procedures

Twenty-five civics curriculum guides representing nineteen states and six local school districts were examined in the spring of 1987. The guides used were representative of states and districts that require or recommend civics at grades eight or nine. Appendix C lists the state and local school districts from which curriculum guides were analyzed using the Civics Curriculum Guide Analysis Form, a modification of the Civics Textbook Analysis Form developed by Davis.[2]

Appendix D includes a copy of the Civics Curriculum Guide Analysis Form. In addition to basic information such as date of publication and grade level, this analysis form used the same categories of economics content as found in the Davis instrument. Civics content was determined by the frequency of civics topics listed in the guides. The guides were analyzed by the author and a graduate assistant conducting an independent analysis to verify reliability of economics and civics content identification.

Table 4 shows that most of the curriculum guides analyzed were recently published; none was published before 1981 and three-fifths were published in 1984, 1985 or 1986. However, eight guides had no publication date.

Table 4

PUBLICATION DATES OF CURRICULUM GUIDES ANALYZED

Dates	Number of Guides
1981	1
1982	0
1983	1
1984	6
1985	5
1986	4
No Date Given	8

As shown in Table 5, three-fifths of the curriculum guides were prepared for grades eight and nine. Ten guides were less specific and stated that they were appropriate for more than one grade, leaving that decision to local school districts, schools, or teachers.

Table 5

GRADES REPRESENTED BY CIVICS CURRICULUM GUIDES

Grade	Number of Guides
6, 7 or 8	1
Junior high school	1
8	8
9	7
9 or 10	2
9, 10, 11 or 12	6
Total	25

Results of Analysis

Economic Content

This section summarizes the analysis of economic content found in the curriculum guides. Based on the quantity of economic content as measured by the amount of space devoted to economics or the number of class days recommended for the different courses, Table 6 presents the percentage of the guides including economics. Obviously, there are great differences among civics curriculum guides, with the average guide devoting about 16% to economic content.

Table 6

PERCENTAGE OF THE GUIDE DEVOTED TO ECONOMICS

Range	0-60%
Median	14%
Mean	15.7%

When the curriculum guides include economics, it is usually as separate units, chapters, or lessons, as shown in Table 7. Table 7 also reveals that seven guides had little or no economic content. Few guides truly integrate economics and civics. When it is successfully integrated, it is more often in the context of history. The North Carolina guide illustrates integration of civics and economics in social problems, economic problems, and global interdependence. The Dade County, Florida guide relates consumer economics to law; the Arkansas and Boston, Massachusetts guides appropriately relate taxation to government functions and services.

Table 7

ECONOMICS INTEGRATION PATTERNS

Type of Relationship of Economics and Civics	Frequency
Economics and civics content largely separate	15
Economics taught as a part of United States or State History	3
Economic and civics content somewhat integrated throughout	1
Curriculum guides with very little or no economic content	6

Table 8 shows the frequency of occurrence of economic content based on the economic content categories from the Davis analysis form. The most frequent economic content includes "Economic Systems" (14),"Government in the Economy" (14),"Markets" (12), "What is Economics?" (11), "Taxation" (11), "International/Global Economics" (10) and "Consumer Issues" (10). Some of the most frequently occurring economic content topics, such as "Economic Systems," "Government in the Economy" and "Taxation," would be appropriate to integrate into a civics course, yet such integration does not often take place.

Some economic content found in the guides does not fit into categories listed above. The most frequently occurring content of this type is "Economic Decision Making" (6) and "Economic Problems and Issues" (5). Although these two subjects were separated in the guides, they could logically be combined.

The guides recommend many different kinds of problems and issues for study in the junior high school civics course. Examples from the guides, with potential for integrating economics, are crime, housing, the federal debt, pollution, civil rights, food, population, poverty, unemployment, resource conservation, energy use, tax reform and economic stability. "Problems and Issues" are also used to teach value dilemmas, such as the right to assemble

if the purpose is to start a riot, and freedom of speech if it is used to slander. In addition, the guides often emphasize the importance of studying local community problems such as waste disposal, maintaining parks and recreation areas, location of a highway, urbanization and neighborhood conditions. Some guides provide a process or framework for studying local problems or issues and urge teachers to select the specific problem. Finally, one question is almost always raised: What is the role of government in the economy?

For most of the guides, it was impossible to determine the depth of treatment of economics or civics expected of teachers in the classroom. Curriculum guides usually provide only goal statements, objectives, generalizations, concepts or topics. The amount of depth in teaching the content and, often, the teaching strategies are left to the teacher's discretion. For this reason, the analysis of economics and civics content does not include the degree of depth expected in teaching the content.

Table 8

ECONOMICS CONTENT TREATED IN CURRICULUM GUIDES

Content	Frequency of Occurrence in Curriculum Guides
What is Economics?	11
Economic Systems	14
Government in the Economy	14
Taxation	11
Fiscal Policy	4
Monetary Policy	2
Markets	12
International/Global Economics	10
Consumer Issues	10
Other:	
U.S. Economic History	4
Economic Decision Making	6
Resource Conservation	3
Labor and Unions	2
Jobs and Careers	3
Economic Problems and Issues	5
Entrepreneurship	2

The paucity of explicit economic content treating values, attitudes and skills is surprising. A possible explanation is that the curriculum guides analyzed were primarily for civics instead of economics; and some of the same skills, attitudes, and values for civics are applicable to the study of economics. For example, library research skills, reading graphs and

reading comprehension skills are essential to an understanding of both civics and economics.

Civics Content

As a source of comparison to the predetermined economic topics from Davis' Civic Textbook Analysis Form, the twenty-five guides in this analysis were used to compile the list of civics topics which are found in Table 9. The most frequently occurring categories of content include "Structure and Functions of Federal, State, and Local Governments" (includes topics such as how a bill becomes a law, checks and balances, the three branches of government, and government services), "Citizenship" (includes civil rights, liberties, individual responsibilities and how one becomes a citizen), "Public Documents" (includes study of the Federal and State Constitutions, the Declaration of Independence, The Bill of Rights and, to a lesser extent, the Articles of Confederation) and "Political Parties/Political Processes" (includes political parties in the United States, voting laws and procedures and juvenile delinquency). As mentioned above, "Skills" tend to be generic such as reading comprehension, listening, distinguishing between fact and opinion and library research skills. "Economic Problems and Issues" cover social, economic and political issues. "Attitudes and Values" include respect for others, respect for private property and patriotism. The author reported only those attitudes and values explicitly stated even though they are implicitly a part of other content in the guides. "International Relations" includes current political relations among several different countries.

The curriculum guides vary greatly regarding the sequence of topics. Comments regarding sequence are largely based on reflection and not on quantified data. At times, the guides begin with a brief history of the United States and emphasize the Constitution and Bill of Rights. This may be followed by an examination of citizenship. In contrast, some guides have citizenship as the first major topic. Citizenship as an early topic includes individual rights and responsibilities and an explanation of representative government and majority rule. In other words, the civics curriculum guides often give early attention to citizenship and its background. Next, one may find a variety of topics including the structure and functions of government, law and political parties and processes. Problems and issues tend to come near the end of the course; however, problems and issues also can be found as a part of the study of structure and functions of local governments.

Table 9

NATURE OF CIVICS CONTENT TREATED IN CURRICULUM GUIDES

Content	Frequency of Occurrence in Curriculum Guides
Most Frequently Occurring Content	
Structure and Functions of Federal, State and Local Government	24
Citizenship	23
Public Documents	19
Political Parties/Political Processes	19
Law	18
Skills	16
Issues and Problems	15
Attitudes and Values	14
International Relations	11
Next Most Frequently Occurring Content	
Democracy	7
Decision Making	7
Role of Lobbyist and Interest Groups	7
The Family and Home	7
Comparative Governments	7
Government Agencies	7
Sometimes Occurring Content	
U.S. History and Heritage	4
Role of the Media	3
Immigration	3
Pluralism, Minorities, and Cultural Ethnic Groups	3

Implications for Materials Development

Authors of civics curriculum guides seem to take a more positive approach toward our political system and a more neutral approach toward our economic system. Characteristics of good citizenship and patriotism are often emphasized in the recommended curricula for civics content. At times, this is in a positive historical context. In contrast, curriculum guide authors are more descriptive and neutral about how the economic system operates.

Civics as a discipline does not appear to be as clearly defined or identified as economics. Even with the most frequently occurring civics content

there are differences in emphasis. Some guides appear to emphasize government structure while some stress government functions. Others devote more attention to the meaning of citizenship, United State history, or political processes. In short, a weakness of recording only the frequency of occurrence of civics topics is the failure to account for the degree of emphasis. In spite of this weakness, consideration of the most commonly taught civics content will be needed in any effort to integrate economics. Thus, with this in mind, the following are examples of the integration of economic content into civics topics:

Structure and Functions of Federal, State and Local Governments

Relate government budgets to family and personal budgets. Relate economic decisions by governments to economic decisions by individuals, and more particularly, by adolescents. These decisions involve scarcity, economic reasoning and opportunity costs. The basic economic content should be included.

Citizenship

Relate to private property rights—especially property of interest to adolescents. In general, relate individual rights to the role of the individual in a market economy.

Public Documents

Public documents could be taught in historical context including the economic reasons for the documents. Parts of the documents could be integrated with economics. To illustrate, the commerce clause of the United State Constitution is used to regulate goods and services adolescents purchase. Economic weaknesses of the Articles of Confederation provides another opportunity to integrate economics and civics.

Political Parties and Political Processes

It seems more difficult to integrate economics with this common civics content. Youth might look at proposed economics legislation and economic planks in political platforms that might affect them. Also, they could analyze the use of Political Action Committee funds.

Law

The Dade County, Florida curriculum guide uses consumer credit and Truth in Lending to relate law and consumer economics. There are several other ways law and economics can be related and, at the same time, take advantage of adolescents' interests, such as a strong interest in automobiles. Analysis of the economics of crime and crime prevention provides opportunity to integrate civics and economics.

Skills

In addition to the generic skills mentioned above, research skills which go beyond the classroom, such as conducting surveys and interviews, are recommended to complement the study of local and state economies.

Issues and Problems

Many of the issues and problems dealt with by governmental units are economic in nature. Issues and problems used for integrated study should be those which are of greatest interest to adolescents. This might include appropriate economic problems and issues at their schools.

Attitudes and Values

Attitudes toward work, respect of property rights, the rights of producers, and the rights of consumers would be appropriate content. To illustrate, the Texas guide includes content which supports competition in the United States economy.

International Relations

This topic provides an opportunity to integrate political relationships and economic relationships, such as international trade among nations. It can be personally motivating when adolescents recognize the effect of these relationships on the availability of foreign made goods.

In summary, among the most frequently occurring civics topics, those with the greatest potential for integration of economics are "Law," "Issues and Problems" and "Public Documents." "Public Documents" would be most easily integrated within an historical context. Using an economic problem, the North Carolina guide illustrates the integration of economics and civics in asking students to consider the opportunity cost of a defeated school tax proposal. Similarly, the Wisconsin guide suggests students analyze a local issue and make a personal choice regarding the issue.

Less frequently occurring civics content with potential for integrating economics includes "Decision-making," "Government Agencies" and "The Family and Home." Several guides present content for decision making in a democracy. This can be related to making economic decisions and the practice of economic reasoning as consumers, producers and citizens. Government agencies touch the lives of adolescents in providing services, many of which are economic. The Boston, Massachusetts guide suggests that students list ten services provided by government, thereby providing the opportunity to study taxation and government expenditures.

Referring back to Table 8, the economic content with potential for integration with civics includes "Economic Systems," "Government on the Economy," "Taxation," "Markets," "International /Global Economics," "Consumer Issues" and "Jobs and Careers." The relationships between "Government in the Economy" and "Taxation" to a civics course are obvious. "Economic Systems" are related to political systems and could be taught together. Students could be asked to identify similarities, such as the

different roles individuals play in an economy and in a political system. "Markets" are appropriate for a civics course because this study will demonstrate the importance of the individual and individual decision making. "Markets" could also be related to "Jobs and Careers" in a way that would be motivating for adolescents. "International/Global Economics" can be an integral part of the study of international relations. "Consumer Issues," "Economic Decision Making" and "Economic Problems and Issues" often include discussion of government intervention. More importantly, decision making, which is found in several guides, can be tied to personal economic decisions.

Conclusions

Limitations of the Study

Although there appeared to be high reliability between the author and the graduate assistant, it would have been a better test of reliability to have more people analyze the guides using the same analysis form. Another limitation was the inability to determine the depth of treatment of economics expected by teachers. Since several guides were in outline form, it often was not possible to know how much attention would really be given economics in the classroom. Another limitation concerned the categories used. Economics categories were already determined in the curriculum Guide Analysis Form; yet categorizing economic content required subjective judgments. These judgments were even more subjective when determining which civics content categories to use. It is likely that another researcher would arrive at different categories using the same content; however, every attempt was made to use inclusive categories.

Suggestions for Curriculum Organization

The following curriculum structures are suggested for consideration in organizing integrated economic and civics content.

- Throughout the curriculum, trace economic, political, and social roles of an adolescent or young adult.

- Build the curriculum around the different decisions people must make using decision making models. This curriculum organization could be adapted to economic, political, and social problems. Show relationships between more personal problems and societal problems.

- Develop the civics curriculum within the context of United States economic and political history using a chronological or topical approach.

- Use case studies, which clearly relate economics to civics and can be motivating for adolescents. As an alternative, provide case studies and a framework for developing case studies and show teachers how to develop case studies or episodes from their own communities, regions or states.

- Prepare an action research curriculum for actively involving students in a study of their community, state, and the United States.

- Select a few themes such as economic, social and political citizenship, government in the economy, consumer issues and laws and develop the curriculum around these themes. Themes selected should emphasize application of content essential for civics and economics.

These suggestions for curriculum organization are not to be considered mutually exclusive; however, they reject the idea of a civics course with separate units about economics or an economic course with separate units about civics. Whatever the curriculum structure, the most basic concepts of economics, such as scarcity, opportunity, cost, and price, should be emphasized.

FOOTNOTES

[1]Davis, James E. "Economics in Middle School Civics Textbooks," Unpublished paper prepared for the Foundation for Teaching Economics, San Francisco, June, 1986.

[2]Ibid.

[3]Butterfield, Ruth I., et.al. "Analyzing Crime and Criminal Control: A Resource Guide." New York: Joint Council on Economic Education, 1981.

Appendix A

Bibliography of Economics Textbooks Analyzed

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF ECONOMICS TEXTBOOKS ANALYZED

Abramowitz, Jack, Roy Adkins, and James H. Rogers. Economics and the American Free Enterprise System. New York: Globe Book Company, 1983.

Brown, Kenneth W. and Allen R. Warner. Economics of Our Free Enterprise System. New York: McGraw-Hill, Inc., 1982.

Clawson, Elmer V. Our Economy: How It Works. Menlo Park, California: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, 1984

Clayton, Gary E., and James E. Brown. Economics Principals and Practices. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Publishing Company, 1983

Smith, Robert F., Michael W. Watts, and Vivian D. Hogan. Free Enterprise - The American Economic System. River Forest, Illinois: Laidlaw Brothers Publishers, 1981 and 1987.

Walker, Lawrence and Janet Glocker. Invitation to Economics. Glenview, Illinois: Scott Foresman and Company, 1982.

Appendix B

Economics Textbook Analysis Form

ECONOMICS TEXTBOOK ANALYSIS FORM

Title _____

Publisher _____

Author(s) _____

Copyright Date _____ No. Pages _____

No. Units _____ No. Chapters _____

EXTENT OF TREATMENT OF CIVICS/LEGAL CONTENT IN TEXT

Separate Chapters _____Yes _____No (Est.) No. of Pages of Civics/Legal _____

Civics/legal Integrated With Other Content? _____Yes _____No

Common Content Integration Pattern _____

_____

_____

_____

NATURE OF CIVICS/LEGAL CONTENT IN TEXT

	Treated?		In Depth?	
	Yes	No	Yes	No
Why government?				
What is government?				
U.S. Constitutional Convention				
Citizen rights and responsibilities				
Three branches of government				
Public Policy decision-making				
The Congress				
The Presidency				
Executive agencies				
Federal court system				
Paying for national government				
Lobbying and interest groups				
State government				
Local government				
Political parties				
Government & the economy				
Foreign Policy				
The role and workings of the courts				
Distinction between criminal and civil justice systems				
Juvenile rights and procedures				
Roles of people in the justice system (police, judges, lawyers, etc.)				
Specific local laws (e.g., drug abuse, traffic				
Sources and purposes of law				
(Other)				

APPROPRIATENESS OF TEACHING STRATEGIES FOR YOUNG ADOLESCENTS

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor
Real World Examples				
Concrete Learn Tasks				
Case Studies				
Simulations				
Cartoons				
General Information of interest to age group				
Data About Society (civic/legal/economic)				

Assessment of General Appropriateness

COMMENT ON APPROPRIATENESS:_____

_____

_____

CONTENT MISSING THAT COULD BE INCLUDED:_____

_____

_____

SUMMARY ANALYSIS/ASSESSMENT_____

_____

_____

_____Initials

of Analyst

Appendix C

States and School Districts of Guides Analyzed

STATES AND SCHOOL DISTRICTS OF GUIDES ANALYZED

Alabama
Arizona
Arkansas
Boston, MA
Delaware
Florida
Georgia
Iowa
Kansas
Kentucky
Louisiana
Memphis, TN
Dade County, FL
Mississippi
North Carolina
North Dakota
Oklahoma
Oldham County, KY
St. Louis, MO
South Carolina
Tennessee
Texas
Virginia
West Virginia
Wisconsin

Appendix D

Civics Curriculum Guide Analysis Form

CIVICS CURRICULUM GUIDE ANALYSIS FORM

State: Year: Grade:

Title:

Course Title:

Estimated Percent of Guide Dealing with Economics:

Economics Content Integration Pattern:

Economics Content	Yes	No
What is Economics		
Economic Systems		
Government in the Economy		
Taxation		
Fiscal Policy		
Monetary Policy		
Markets		
International/Global Economics		
Consumer Issues		
U.S. Economic History		
Other		

Civics Content

The Foundation for Teaching Economics is a national non-profit tax-exempt public foundation under 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code.

The Foundation's purpose is to foster understanding of the American economic system and of the importance of the individual within that system. Through education, the Foundation seeks to prepare young people to become economically literate voters, wise consumers, and productive citizens. The programs and educational materials of the Foundation are focused primarily on economic education for young adolescents, grades 7-10.

Foundation for Teaching Economics

550 Kearny Street, Suite 1000, San Francisco, CA 94108